

Prof. dr hab. Agnieszka Sitko-Lutek
Kierownik Katedry Zarządzania, UMCS

DISSERTATION REVIEW REPORT

Review of the Doctoral Dissertation in the field of Management and Quality Sciences

"Employability Market Orientation in Iran"

written by Ph. D. Candidate Leila Shoraka,
prepared under the supervision of:

Assoc. Prof. dr hab. Anna Pawłowska, University of Warsaw, Faculty of Management,
Dr. Yaghoob Maharati, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad, Faculty of Economics and Administrative Sciences.

1. Selection of the topic, purpose of the work and research questions

Dynamic changes occurring in the functioning of modern enterprises result in the fact that managers increasingly face new challenges emerging from the necessity to adapt to new conditions. A change of the approach to management becomes necessary to allow for a faster response to changes and, as the author of the dissertation claims, create *new principles, where timeframes for strategic decisions are shorter*. This requires significant changes *in modern organizations in careers, more flexible employment, and more employable labour markets. Therefore, organizations have moved on from traditional human resource management (HRM) procedures and implement flexible human resource management (FHRM). (...) Flexibility in human resource management helps organizations overcome market demand uncertainty, succeed in competitive advantage, and preserve business sustainability* (p. 9).

In the introduction to the dissertation, the author writes: *FHRM uses strategies that may cause downsizing or 'planned elimination of positions or jobs' and its effect on employer-employee relations that have moved towards a new transactional psychological contract. Previous research displays that employees' career life has changed, and the average employed time for one employer is becoming shorter, so the employee in this situation feels a sense of job insecurity and anxiety about professional development. (...) Scholars introduced employability as a proactive adaptation strategy in the changeable, uncertain, and competitive modern economic structural environment* (p. 9). The author emphasizes that *Employability Market*

Orientation (EMO) is a behaviour model in employability competencies presented by Pawłowska¹ in Poland adapted to the flexibility of human resource management and short-term contracts (p.10). The author believes that it would be advisable to investigate Employability Market Orientation (EMO) in different economic contexts and cultures.

The PhD student claims that because *Iranian organizations have to move towards flexible human resource management to survive in today's competitive environment, it is required to present a comprehensive model in employability competencies of employees that adapt to the flexibility of human resource management and short-term contracts.* Therefore, the following research question can be formulated: *Can Employability Market Orientation (EMO) improve employability and decrease the sense of job insecurity of the employees in Iran regardless of geographical boundaries, cultural and economic differences?* (p. 10).

Literature review on selected phenomena concerning the contemporary human resource management, employee adaptation to new employment relations, Polish and Iranian socio-economics and culture points out that despite the implementation of several different research projects, a number of research gaps can be identified. According to the author, these are the following (p. 48-51):

1. Employability Market Orientation (EMO) concept was only investigated among Polish employees. Therefore, this theory should be replicated and validated for other cultures. As a consequence, it would be interesting to examine this model in Iran. It is advisable to examine the behavior of employees and the role of culture.
2. In the research conducted in Poland, the attribution style was not taken into account. Because frequent failures, obstacles, and changes at the workplace can influence individuals' attribution styles and affect employees' employment stability, it is important to become familiar with how employees react in changing labour markets in relation to their attribution style. It is advisable to examine attribution styles in order to diagnose how employees interpret phenomena and their causes.
3. It is advisable to study the socio-demographic variables of employees in the context of Employability Market Orientation (EMO).
4. The Employability Market Orientation (EMO) concept is designed for organizations that use flexible human resource management (FHRM). The question arises whether this model works in organizations which are planning to implement/ are in the process of implementing FHRM.

¹ Pawłowska A., *Zatrudnialność pracobiorcy w elastycznym zarządzaniu ludźmi*, Polskie Wydawnictwo Ekonomiczne, Warszawa 2017

5. The influence of cultural factors on the Employability Market Orientation (EMO) model is worth examining, e.g. in the form of a comparison of the results of empirical research in Poland and Iran.

In her research, the doctoral student took up the problem of the employability of employees and factors influencing it. She based her research on the concept of Employability Market Orientation (EMO). It is a model that focuses on employees' behaviour in acquiring employability competencies in the flexibility of human resource management and short-term contracts, which was presented and tested by A. Pawłowska in Poland². For the purpose of the reviewed doctoral dissertation, the PhD student supplemented Pawłowska's model with factors that were identified by the author as research gaps. The empirical research was conducted in Iran. The main research question posed by the author was: *Does Employability Market Orientation (EMO) improve employees' employability, and decrease the employees' job insecurity in Iran regardless of cultural and economic differences? Furthermore, it is worth noting which factors from the dimension of individual or organizational determinants increase or decrease the Iranian employees' EMO. Demographic, individual and organizational factors that develop the Iranian employees' EMO were also identified (p. 52-53).*

Therefore, it can be concluded that the research problem discussed in the dissertation is valid as well as original, especially in the conditions of the Iranian economy. This problem is still not fully recognized in the literature, and the results of the research so far are fragmentary – the research conducted in Poland did not take into account all the aspects that were included in the model developed by the PhD student. This indicates a cognitive research gap.

The main goals of this dissertation are, in the opinion of the doctoral student, as follows (p. 53):

1. *How Iranian employees adapt to the flexibility of human resource management and changes in the relationship between the employee and the employer, based on EMO model and what employees' EMO depends on;*
2. *Identifying the factors that influence Iranian workers' EMO levels (demographic, individual, and organizational factors);*
3. *Comparison of Iranian and Polish research results;*

² Ibidem

4. *Presentation of the results with additional variables not included in the Polish study (Flexible human resource management as organizational determinants and Attribution style as an individual one).*

When assessing the formulated goals, I conclude that they were presented in a clear and precise manner.

In the opinion of the doctoral student, in order to achieve the above research goals, six main research questions should be answered (pp. 53-54):

1. *Do employees who exhibit EMO have better rates of Employability?*
2. *Do employees who exhibit EMO feel a low level of Job insecurity?*
3. *Do employees who exhibit EMO have special socio-demographic and employment related characteristics: age/gender/education/marital status/type of contract/work experience/management position/the number of jobs to now/employment time in current job/planning for working in the current job?*
4. *Do employees with EMO have individual psychological features?*
 - 4.1. *Do employees with EMO have special Cognitive Flexibility level?*
 - 4.2. *Do employees with EMO have a special Attribution style?*
 - 4.2.1. *Which dimensions of Attribution style (Locus of control, Stability and Controllability) have relationship with EMO?*
 - 4.3. *Do employees with EMO have a special career adapt ability level?*
5. *Do organizational factors influence employees EMO level?*
 - 5.1. *Do employees with EMO work in specific organizations? (private vs. public)*
 - 5.2. *Does the level of EMO depend on the Psychological Contract in which they work? (relational vs. transactional)*
 - 5.3. *Do employees with EMO work in organizations with FHRM?*
 - 5.4. *Do organizations with FHRM impact employee's individual determinants to improve EMO?*
 - 5.5. *Do organizations with transactional contract impact employee's individual determinants to improve EMO?*
6. *What are the differences and similarities comparing Polish and Iranian research studies?*

It can be concluded that the research questions were formulated correctly and explain the research intentions of the dissertation, identifying the detailed problems around which the considerations were focused on both in the theoretical and empirical parts of the reviewed doctoral dissertation. In order to achieve the objectives of the dissertation, as many as fifteen

research hypotheses were formulated in the course of the review of literature. These research hypotheses were formulated in relation to the following research questions (pp. 54-62):

- to answer questions 1 and 2, the following hypotheses were formulated:

H1: There is a positive relationship between EMO and Employability.

H2: There is a negative relationship between EMO and Job insecurity.

- to answer question 3, the following hypotheses were proposed:

H3: There is a relationship between socio-demographic variables and EMO.

H3a: There is a relationship between age and EMO.

H3b: There is a relationship between gender and EMO.

H3c: There is a relationship between employee's marital status and EMO.

H3d: There is a relationship between employee's education level and EMO.

H3e: There is a relationship between employee's managerial position (executive manager) in the workplace and EMO.

H3f: There is a relationship between employee's type of contract (permanent vs temporary) and EMO.

H3g: There is a relationship between work experience and EMO.

H3i: There is a relationship between the employment time in current company and EMO.

H3j: There is a relationship between the number of jobs and EMO.

H3k: There is a relationship between planning for working in the current job and EMO.

- to answer questions 4 and 4.1, the following hypotheses were proposed:

H4: There is a relationship between Cognitive Flexibility and EMO.

H4a: There is a relationship between cognitive control and EMO.

H4b: There is a relationship between cognitive alternatives and EMO.

- to answer question 4.2, the following hypotheses were proposed:

H5: There is a relationship between EMO and Attribution style.

H5a: There is a relationship between EMO and Locus of control.

H5b: There is a relationship between EMO and Stability.

H5c: There is a relationship between EMO and Controllability.

- to answer question 4.3, the following hypotheses were proposed:

H6: There is a relationship between CAAS and EMO.

H6a: There is a relationship between Concern and EMO.

H6b: There is a relationship between Control and EMO.

H6c: There is a relationship between Curiosity and EMO.

H6d: There is a relationship between Confidence and EMO.

- to answer questions 5, 5.1, 5.2, the following hypotheses were proposed:

H7: There is a different level of EMO between private and public sectors.

- to answer questions 5.3 and 5.4, the following hypotheses were proposed:

H8: There is a relationship between organizations with FHRM and EMO.

H9: FHRM moderates the relations between Attribution style and EMO.

H9a: FHRM moderates the relationships between Locus of control and EMO.

H9b: FHRM moderates the relationships between Stability and EMO.

H9c: FHRM moderates the relationships between Controllability and EMO.

H10: FHRM moderates the relationships between Cognitive Flexibility and EMO.

H10a: FHRM moderates the relationships between cognitive control and EMO.

H10b: FHRM moderates the relationships between cognitive alternatives and EMO.

H11: FHRM moderates the relationships between CAAS and EMO.

H11a: FHRM moderates the relationships between Concern and EMO.

H11b: FHRM moderates the relationships between Control and EMO.

H11c: FHRM moderates the relationships between Curiosity and EMO.

H11d: FHRM moderates the relations relationships between Confidence and EMO.

- to answer question 5.5, the following hypotheses were proposed:

H12: Psychological Contract moderates the relationships between Attribution style and EMO.

H12a: Psychological Contract moderates the relationships between Locus of control and EMO.

H12b: Psychological Contract moderates the relationships between Stability and EMO.

H12c: Psychological Contract moderates the relationships between Controllability and EMO.

H13: Psychological Contract moderates the relationships between Cognitive Flexibility and EMO.

H13a: Psychological Contract moderates the relationships between cognitive control and EMO.

H13b: Psychological Contract moderates the relationships between cognitive alternatives and EMO.

H14: Psychological Contract moderates the relationships between CAAS and EMO.

H14a: Psychological Contract moderates the relationships between Concern and EMO.

H14b: Psychological Contract moderates the relationships between Control and EMO.

H14c: Psychological Contract moderates the relationships between Curiosity and EMO.

H14d: Psychological Contract moderates the relationships between Confidence and EMO.

- to answer question 6, the following hypotheses were proposed:

H15: The results of EMO model in Iran has differences and similarities with that of Poland.

H15a: There are differences in the relationship between individual/organizational indicators and EMO in Iran and Poland.

H15b: There are similarities in the relationship between EMO and adaptive indicators (Employability and Job insecurity) in Iran and Poland.

Research questions, research hypotheses assigned to them and research variables were compiled by the author in Table 2-1. *Research questions, hypotheses and variables* (pp. 63-64). Taking into account the large number of research questions and research hypotheses, presenting them in the tabular form indicated their logical arrangement and significantly improved the readability of this fragment of the dissertation. However, in my opinion, it would be advisable to limit the number of research hypotheses and present them in a more synthetic form.

In the further part of the dissertation, the PhD student presented two research models: Model 1 (Figure 2-1, p. 65) and Model 2 (Figure 2-2, p. 66). The presented models take into account the procedure of testing the individual hypotheses. The difference between the two models is how organizational factors are positioned as independent variables (Model 1) or moderator ones (Model 2). Model 1 includes the testing of eight hypotheses - H: 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, and 9, while Model 2 - twelve - H: 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15. As a consequence, research hypotheses H8 and H9 were tested only in Model 1, while hypotheses H: 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, and 15 only in Model 2. It should be stated that none of the presented models scheduled the testing of H1. The question remains why the PhD student did not consider testing this hypothesis. I believe the development of a single research model that would comprehensively cover all the studied problems would increase the scientific value of the reviewed dissertation.

To sum up, I consider the selected topic of the doctoral dissertation as appropriate, important and up-to-date, which proves that the doctoral student has a good understanding of

the current problems of management and quality sciences. The research problem is interesting from the cognitive and scientific perspective in the conditions of the Iranian economy. Additionally, the doctoral student demonstrated adequate knowledge of research issues in formulating the objectives of the work, research problems, research hypotheses and constructing research models.

2. Structure and layout of the work

The reviewed doctoral dissertation covers a total of 180 pages and consists of an introduction and three substantive chapters, which constitute the main text consisting of 138 pages. The remaining 42 pages contain the Statistical Annex and the Bibliography (encompassing 230 items) as well as the List of Tables and List of Figures. The work contains 75 tables (including 21 tables in the Statistical Annex) and 38 figures (including 10 figures in the Statistical Annex).

The dissertation follows the standard layout and the division into theoretical and empirical parts, which results from the adopted research procedure. It is a system with a logical and coherent structure, which is confirmed by the correct preparation of the content of the dissertation. There are noticeable disproportions in the volume of individual chapters. The third chapter, which presents the results, is slightly longer than the other two. It seems that the theoretical part of the work (Chapter 1), which is 37 pages long, is too short. Nevertheless, it can be concluded that the layout and sequence of the discussed issues, taking into account the research procedure, are correct. The author pursues her research intentions in a logical order.

3. Evaluation of research methods and tools

Taking into account the topic of the dissertation and the assumed research goals, it can be concluded that the methodology of the work is correct. The dissertation is theoretical and empirical.

The theoretical part of the dissertation, included in the first chapter of the dissertation, was developed on the basis of a literature review and its critical analysis. The literature analysis was conducted correctly.

The author analyzed the literature on the subject of contemporary human resource management, employee adaptation to new employment relations, Polish and Iranian socio-economics and culture.

In the theoretical part, the author focused her attention on the issues necessary to develop the research concept and prepare research model and research tools. The following

issues were discussed: flexible human resource management, contemporary employment relations in the context of changes in psychological contracts, employee job insecurity as a result of the transactional psychological contract in contemporary organizations, employability as a feature of an employee in the modern labour market, Employability Market Orientation (EMO) as a new model of employee adaptive meta-competencies, selected individual determinants of Employability Market Orientation (EMO), cognitive flexibility of employee, attribution style of employee, Career Adapt-Ability Scale (CAAS) as an alternative model of employee adaptive meta-competencies and comparative analysis of the Iranian and Polish socio-economics and culture based on Hofstede's cross-cultural theory. As a result of the literature review, the PhD student identified a research gap presenting a need for scientific research.

The author discussed in detail the Employability Market Orientation (EMO) model developed by A. Pawłowska, which was tested in Poland. A relatively extensive presentation of this model is justified, because it was tested by the PhD student in Iran during her empirical research. However, it was extended to include a number of other factors. As the PhD student states, in Poland, the following were examined: Professional Flexibility as an individual factor and Boundaryless Career as an individual factor, while in Iran: Attribution style as an individual factor, FHRM as an independent organizational factor, FHRM as a moderating role of individual factors, Psychological Contract as a moderating role of individual factors, Measuring the relationship of Managerial Position with EMO, and Measuring the relationship of Marital Status with EMO (Table 2-9, p. 51).

The literature studies allowed the PhD student to create a theoretical basis for the research problem, which was later subjected to empirical analysis in the second chapter. The chapter discusses the research methodology – formulation of a research problem, research goals, research questions, research hypotheses and models, models of conducted research and method, research sample, data collection method — indicators and measurements and statistical analysis method.

The third chapter presents the results - descriptive statistics of the research sample, investigation of research hypotheses, discussion, conclusion, theoretical contributions, practical implementations, research limitations, suggestions for future research.

The dissertation also includes the Statistical Annex and References.

As already mentioned, the PhD student developed two conceptual research models on the basis of which the formulated research hypotheses were verified. The research method used in this study is *a descriptive correlational method to examine the relationship between*

individual and organizational variables with the behavioural model of employability. This research is a survey-analytical method that uses standard questionnaires for each variable (pp. 66-67). The research methodology of this study was presented in Table 2-2 (p. 68):

- *Research Approach – Quantitative;*
- *Research Orientation - Applied research;*
- *Research Strategy – Survey;*
- *Sampling Plan - Possible Sampling;*
- *Sampling Method - Simple randomized;*
- *Research Tools – Questionnaire;*
- *Statistical Population - Employees work in private sector; Employees work in public sector;*
- *Statistical Analysis - Correlation analysis, Multiple Regression analysis by SPSS and SEM (AMOS).*

Since the PhD student assumed that the results of the research conducted in Iran would be compared to the research conducted in Poland, the number of participants should be the same (300 respondents – 150 people from the public and private sectors each). The research covered employees from two groups:

- Employees working in the public sector (civil servants),
- Employees working in the private sector (sales staff).

Employees were hired under two types of psychological contracts (relational and transactional). The groups are contrasted in terms of the rules that govern the relationship between the employer and the employee. It was assumed that in the private sector, the employees have a temporary contract and work based on a transactional psychological contract and whose job is short-term and unstable. On the other hand, in the public sector, employees have a permanent contract with a relational psychological contract. In other words, public employees are considered to have long-term and stable jobs.

Ultimately, 320 respondents were surveyed, including 169 civil servants (public organizations) and 151 sales staff members (private organizations).

As the PhD student writes, *in this study, a survey research method through a questionnaire was used to collect information and data. The questionnaire of this research consists of eight standard questionnaires in research variables and their dimensions.*

The framework of the questionnaire of this research has nine main parts. The first includes demographic information including age, gender, marital status, level of education,

work experience, type of contract, organizational position, and job change rate so far, and the decision to continue working in the current organization.

Sections two and three include questions related to Employability, Psychological Contract, Attributional Style, Career Adapt-Abilities Scale (CAAS), Cognitive Flexibility Index, Job Insecurity Index, Flexible Human Resource Management, and measuring the behavioural competency employability model (pp. 70-71).

For measuring the reliability, Cronbach's alpha coefficient was used to assess the questionnaire's reliability, given that the level of measurement is sequential with five ranks. Therefore, as the author claims, *after translating the questionnaire to Persian, it was distributed in a pilot test including 30 of the participants to measure the questionnaire's reliability (p. 71).* However, although not all items of the questionnaire were confirmed as reliable, the author writes nothing about the verification of the research tools. The question is: What was the purpose of the pilot studies?

In the second chapter, the author describes in detail all individual variable indicators used in all questionnaires. This description is very extensive (a total of 121 items are included), but is it necessary? It seems reasonable for the research questionnaires used in to study to be included an appendix.

As a result of the conducted research, a very extensive empirical material was obtained. The PhD student examined the behavioral model of Employability Market Orientation among Iranian employees and determined the individual and organizational factors influencing it. Two models of research were tested in this study to determine the status of individual and organizational factors. In Model 1 (based on Pawłowska's model), organizational factors (flexibility of human resource management and psychological contract) were examined as performing an independent role. In Model 2, organizational determinants play a moderating role. The relationships assumed in this study is based on the presented conceptual models, based on samples of employees of public and private companies in Iran.

Before testing the hypotheses, the descriptive statistics were used to characterize the data collected in the research - the mean and standard deviation of the research variables. In order to examine the distributions for possible issues that could violate the assumptions of normality, such as excessive skew and outliers, the histograms of these variables were examined.

Before evaluating the proposed structural model, it was necessary to examine the significance of the factor load of the questionnaire to ensure the suitability of measurement tools and the acceptability of their indicators in measuring structures. This was done using the Confirmatory Factor Analysis (CFA) technique and AMOS software.

Structural equation modelling using the Amos software was used to test hypotheses H1-H14. The correlation coefficient and regression coefficient were used to test research hypotheses. In relation to some of the hypotheses, the moderating role of the surveyed factors was examined. Not all hypotheses were confirmed.

The PhD student also made the comparison of testing the EMO model and determining the influence of organizational and individual factors on EMO in Iran and Poland (Table 3-39, p. 128). However, the reviewed dissertation does not present the results of research conducted in Poland. The doctoral student does not indicate the source of the data containing the results of the research conducted in Poland.

Summing up, it can be stated that the applied research methods and data analysis were correctly selected in relation to the problem at hand. The PhD student manifested the knowledge of the applied research methods and techniques, described the research methodology in a sufficiently comprehensive manner and drew conclusions correctly.

4. Assessment of scientific value

The scientific value of the dissertation will be assessed in relation to the individual chapters of the reviewed dissertation.

The first chapter is theoretical. It was developed based on the literature review and online materials. The author practically limited her considerations to the problems necessary to develop the concept of empirical research, the research model and research tools. Taking into account the nature of the reviewed dissertation, it would be advisable to present a broader context of the issues under study.

Taking into account the fact that the empirical research was conducted in Iran, the author analyzed the literature in the following order: general perspective and the given problem in Iranian literature. I have reservations as to whether such an arrangement is justified. In the case of Iranian literature, mainly the results of empirical research carried out in Iran were presented. They could be considered as a continuation of the general perspective of the analysis of the literature on a given subject. Would it not be reasonable to devote one subchapter to present the specificity of the situation in Iran in the various aspects considered in the research?

In the theoretical part, the author has a very solid approach to the presentation of the definitions of the discussed concepts, often presenting a number of definitions in the form of tables (e.g. Table 1-3, pp. 27-29; Table 1-5, p. 26). She analyzes those definitions, which significantly improves the clarity of the argument. However, an explicit statement of how a given concept would be defined in the further part of the paper could be added.

In subsection 1-5. *Employability Market Orientation (EMO) as a new model of employee adaptive meta-competencies*, the PhD student presents the concept of EMO by A. Pawłowska relatively broadly. It is justified in the context of the preparation of research tools. However, it would be advisable to discuss the obtained research results. In the further part of the work (Chapter 3), the author carries out a comparative analysis of the results obtained in Poland and Iran, but the dissertation does not include data on the results of research obtained in Poland.

Subsections 1.6.2. *Attribution style of employee in subchapter*, 1.6.2.1. *General perspective* also discussed the results of research carried out in Iran. Therefore, what is the purpose of subchapter 1.6.2.2. *Attribution style in Iranian literature* which refers to what has been previously discussed?

Some reservations are raised by the data presented in subsection 1.7.1. *The Iranian and Polish socio-economics*. The periods covered by the presented quantitative data were not specified (Table 1-8, p. 44; Table 1-9, p. 46). I also have doubts about the possibility of comparing labor market indicators in Poland and Iran. When presenting the structure of the indicators, 10 or 15 years of age are taken into account as the working age of the population (pp. 44-45), while in Poland, according to the data of the Central Statistical Office, it is calculated from the age of 18. Information should be added in order to clarify that the author uses only Iranian materials (Table 1-9, p. 46).

In subsection 1.7.2. *The Iranian and Polish culture based on Hofstede cross-cultural theory*, the author bases her considerations only on Hofstede's concept and presents the results obtained by him. It is currently the most frequently presented concept of culture, but the question arises whether the presentation of national cultures should not be extended to include other sources and concepts, all the more so as the cultural factor is analyzed in the empirical part of the work.

Assessing the theoretical part of the work, it can be concluded that it was written on the basis of sufficiently extensive and relevant literature. The author demonstrated a well-mastered ability to use literature. However, a slightly broader approach to the argument that was presented would be advisable. Nevertheless, the considerations presented therein made it possible to systematize the approach to the presented problems.

In the second chapter, the author approaches the presentation of the discussed problems in great detail. She correctly formulates the research problem, goals and research questions. However, the research concept developed by the author is very extensive, which gives the

impression of chaos. This impression is deepened by a very large number of research hypotheses and the development of two research models.

Research tools are another problem. The author declares the development of eight questionnaires for survey research. Although in subsections 2.5.2. and 2.5.3. all the indicators used in the study are presented, there are 121 of them, which makes it completely unreadable. Why are the questionnaires not included in the appendix?

In subsection 2.5.1. *General information* and in the pilot study results, the author writes that the pilot study was conducted on a sample of 30 respondents. However, in the dissertation she only assesses the reliability of the Cronbach's alpha test, but neither writes nor verifies the research tools. The research sample is described in subsection 2.4. *Research*. Moreover, it states that the selection of the sample in the actual research was random, but also does not indicate the method of sampling.

The third chapter analyzes the obtained results. The doctoral student very broadly presents the statistical analysis of the obtained results. Additional results of the statistical analysis are included in the statistical annex. Considering the breadth of the research material, this analysis is very extensive. However, it should be emphasized that the presentation of aggregate results is justified -Table 3-2. *Results of confirmatory factor analysis and convergent validity of the items of questionnaire* (pp. 96-98), Table 3-3. *The result of differential validity of factor analysis and correlation between variables* (p. 99), Table 3-4. *Fit indicators of confirmatory factor analysis models of variables* (p. 99).

In subsection 3.2. *Investigation of research hypotheses*, a detailed analysis was performed concerning the results of the structural equation modeling with the Amos software used to test hypotheses H1-H14. Section 3.2.5. *Polish and Iranian results of EMO model test, Comparative analysis* tested hypothesis H15. The results of the analysis are presented in Table 3-39. The comparison of testing the EMO model and determining the influence of organizational and individual factors on EMO in Iran and Poland was discussed (p. 128).

In subsection 3.3. *Discussion*, the doctoral student analyzed the research results in detail in the form of subsequent research questions. In conclusion, two conceptual models were tested. Both models are quite similar to each other in considering four main variables including individual, organizational, socio-demographics and adaptability. The difference between these models is the role of organizational factors. In Model 1, organizational factors act as independent variables. However, in Model 2, organizational factors play a moderating role. Based on the results, both of these models show no relationship between job insecurity and

controllability of attribution style with EMO. In Model 1, locus of control has no relationship with EMO. On the other hand, in Model 2, stability has no significant correlation with EMO. Both of these models confirm the relationship of individuals, organizational and adaptive behavior (Employability) with EMO. Figure 3-23 (p. 134) shows the confirmed Model 1, while Figure 3-24 (p. 134) shows the confirmed Model 2.

The main results of the conducted empirical research can be summarized, in the words of the PhD Student, as follows (p. 135):

- *EMO can enhance employability in Iranian employees.*
- *EMO was not significantly related with employee's job insecurity in Iran.*
- *Education in Iranian employees has a positive relationship with EMO.*
- *Individual's locus of control as attribution style dimension needs organizational determinants as a condition to express EMO.*

When assessing the empirical part of the work, it should be emphasized that the PhD student implemented the procedure of solving the research problem, and presented the results of individual stages of the research in an orderly and consistent manner. The doctoral student demonstrated the ability to analyze the obtained data and formulate appropriate conclusions.

The main added value of this dissertation is that research on the Employability Market Orientation (EMO) and its adaptation to cultural and economic conditions in Iran has been done for the first time.

It can be concluded that with her dissertation, the PhD student makes a cognitive, methodological and practical contribution to the science of management and quality, and indicates further research directions that may inspire other researchers and future scientific explorations.

To sum up, I assess the scientific value of the dissertation positively. In my opinion, the doctoral student solved the research problem posed in the thesis. The considerations therein are consistent, based on appropriate literature studies and appropriate empirical research. They are correctly analyzed, with correctly formulated conclusions and recommendations.

5. Formal side of the study

In general, it can be said that the dissertation was written rather correctly. The correct division into chapters and subchapters was used, bibliographic notes were placed in footnotes, the language of the dissertation is correct. The author, however, did not avoid certain editorial and formal errors, e.g. in subsection 3.3. only one sub-chapter was distinguished, 3.1.1. *Results*

of structural validity study - Convergent validity and discriminant validity. In Table 1-8, (p. 44) and Table 1-9, (p. 46) the period covered by the quantitative data is not given. Additionally, item 148 is incorrectly given in the Bibliography - Pawlowska, A. (2020). Employability Market Orientation of Employee on the Gig Economy Labor Market. Management Problems – Management Issues, 17 (6 (86)), 58-73 (p. 170). This is a slightly altered repetition of item 147. There were minor editorial errors in the dissertation.

6. Conclusion

When making the final evaluation of the work of Ph.D. Candidate Leila Shoraka, despite the critical comments, I state that the PhD student took up an important and current topic in her work, made an original contribution to the science of management and quality, manifested by presenting conclusions and recommendations regarding internal communication strategies and implementation of changes in management systems. The doctoral student specified the aims of the dissertation, which she managed to achieve, and chose the research tools properly. The reviewed work is formally correct and has a logical and coherent structure.

Taking into account the above considerations, I conclude that the doctoral dissertation of Ph.D. Candidate Leila Shoraka entitled "Employability Market Orientation in Iran" meets the expectations and requirements for doctoral dissertations specified in the Act on academic degrees and academic title of March 14, 2003, as amended.

In view of the foregoing, the reviewed dissertation may constitute the basis for the award of the academic degree of doctor of economic sciences in the discipline of management and quality sciences, and I request that it be admitted to public defense.

Reasumując, stwierdzam, że przedłożona mi do recenzji praca mgr Leili Shoraka spełnia wymogi stawiane pracom doktorskim zawarte w art. 13 Ustawy z dnia 14 marca 2003 o stopniach naukowych i tytule naukowym oraz o stopniach i tytułach w zakresie sztuki (Dz.U. 2003 Nr 63, poz.595 wraz z późniejszymi zmianami) tj. w szczególności stanowi oryginalne rozwiązanie problemu naukowego, wykazuje ogólną wiedzę teoretyczną Kandydatki w dyscyplinie nauk o zarządzaniu i jakości oraz umiejętność samodzielnego prowadzenia pracy naukowej. Wnoszę o przyjęcie rozprawy i dopuszczenie do publicznej obrony.

Silke - Lutz Agnew