

Profesor Piotr Górski Ph.D.

Faculty of Management

University of Sciences and Technology

Cracow

REVIEW

Review of a doctoral dissertation of Mr. Mehmet Ali Özçobanlar M.A. "*Anatolian Tigers Phenomenon. The Cross Cultural Capital Diversification of the Globally Successful Companies*" written at the Faculty of Management, University of Warsaw under the academic supervision of Prof. Tomasz Ochowski.

1. Formal statements

This review is conducted on the basis of the resolution of the Board of the Faculty of Management, University of Warsaw. The said board has appointed me as a reviewer of the above mentioned doctoral dissertation as informed by the Dean, prof. dr hab. Alojzy Nowak.

The subject of the review is the typescript of total volume of 14 pages numbered with Roman numerals (Abstract, Table of contents, List of abbreviations, List of schemes and List of tables) and 205 pages including main dissertation's text, bibliography and appendices containing: Anatolian Tigers Companies Rhetoric Analysis, Anatolian Tigers Companies' Websites' Texas, Research Questions and Results of Quantitative Analysis.

Dissertation's main component is divided into five chapters. Each of them is also divided into subchapters, but they don't included an introduction and a summary. The structure of dissertation is well balanced, bibliography includes 13 pages of positions, in total about 190 books, articles and texts available from internet, exclusively in English. The dissertation includes a theoretical grounding and method explanation. References are appropriate to standards of literature selection, usage and the text clarity.

General evaluation of the dissertation

Mr Mehmet Ali Özçobanlar takes up an interesting problem of showing the phenomenon of Anatolian Tigers. This is important for researchers studying the processes of urbanization,

Yok

changes of social structure and cultural foundations of management. The study of Turkish economy could also be very helpful for everybody who wants to get a knowledge about development of developing country in a processes of globalization. The reviewed dissertation gives answers to the questions about the role of culture, especially religion, with economic activities. This is one of the classical theme of European social sciences concerning the origin of capitalist economy and society. Mr Mehmet Ali Özçobanlar tries to show that Islamic culture helps the activity of Turkish entrepreneurs.

Term *Anatolian Tigers* refers to a number of cities in central Turkey whose industrial prowess has resulted in impressive growth rates for the region and nation since the 1980s. The term also used to refer to the many successful entrepreneurs from these cities, as well as to the emerging Turkish middle class. Mr Mehmet Ali Özçobanlar's dissertation refers to the second meaning of this term, to entrepreneurs from Anatolian cities.

The first chapter of the dissertation Introduction consists of 5 points which include: background of the problem, rationale and statement of the problem, the purpose of the research, importance of the study and definition of terms. On the first page the author gives a reference in which he informs the reader of this dissertation that *Parts of this dissertation have been already published in books, journals and websites by the author. Detailed information is given in the bibliography.* In fact, the bibliography includes some positions of Özçobanlar but the reader does not know which parts of the dissertation has been published earlier in the publications contain in the bibliography.

In the Introduction the author points out to the challenges ensuing globalization, especially cultural differences of customer's behaviour and a role of knowledge about culture and skills to deal with in multicultural environment. The purpose of the research he describes as: *illuminate the Anatolian Tigers phenomenon and their success in cross-cultural management.* Achievement of this aim included a comparison between two neighbouring but different countries, Greece and Turkey, to emphasize the cultural dimensions of this phenomenon. This comparison forms the background of his study. The last part of the Introduction includes the definitions of some important for the research terms. The definitions come from various sources. What seems to be important is a weak relationship between given definitions and theoretical foundation of the research. Some definitions come from Dictionary and Wikipedia. Book of Thomas and Peterson from which definition of cross – cultural management comes, is only in the bibliography. Only definitions of three terms logos, ethos and pathos and rhetoric analysis refer to the positions used in the research.

The chapter II, Literature review gives the theoretical background of the essential terms – culture. This chapter includes also knowledge about Turkish and Greek culture and presents economic perspectives of Turkey and Greece. This chapter includes data and information about process of urbanization, gross domestic expenditure on R&D and number of patent applications that are important for characteristic of contemporary economy. This chapter includes also Pierre Bourdieu theory of social, symbolic and cultural capital.

Chapter III concerning Anatolian Tigers is very important for this dissertation, where Mr. Özçobanlar presents the evolution of this phenomenon. He describes the socio-economic and

cultural background of the Anatolian firms and cities before and during the neoliberal globalization process in the last 40 years. Using various sources, statistical data, interviews with entrepreneurs and studies of Turkish and Arab researchers, doctoral student presents various aspects of the development of Anatolian Tigers. The author indicates both political and economic factors, and above all cultural ones. He presents activities in the area of government economic policy, changes in the banking system and management not only of organizations of market sector but also of public sphere. He refers to the examples of Anatolian cities, companies and entrepreneurs.

In Chapter IV Methodology the author describes and explains the choice of research methods and shows research questions, points to the limitations of the research and presents 11 factors related to cross cultural dimension that has been investigated.

The main problem of the dissertation Mr Özçobanlar describes as follows: *what are the dimensions of cultural capital as a factor of Anatolian Tigers' globally success?* (p. 62) He also points to two particular problems:

The first - *What is cultural background of Anatolian Tigers activity?* To solve this problem author used quantitative approach analysing the existing resource. He used data from the latest Third European Quality of Life Survey Questionnaire" -European Quality of Life Survey , 2011 – 2012 and applied the exploratory factor analysis (E F A) to compare the structure of cultural capital in Greece and Turkey. I appreciate the choice of method and decision on comparing two neighbouring societies. Greece has been a member of EU since 1981 and Turkey officially has the status of a candidate of EU since 1999. The process of Europeanization is, besides globalization, recognized by the prof. M. Evren Tok as important for the development of Anatolian Tigers.

In this chapter the author also presents the 11 factors related to cross cultural dimension used in the comparison between Greece and Turkey. He distinguishes: education, political trust component, voluntary work component, political participation component, life satisfaction component, trust in people, fears of others, life satisfaction, happiness, income in PPP Euros and deprivation index. All distinguished factors base on theoretical background, theory of cultural capital P. Bourdieu and R. Putnam's social capital. The author shows the questions, corresponding variables and scales used for measurement. This part of considerations dedicated to methodological issues could be considered appropriate and allowing to answer the above question.

The second particular problem was presented as follows. *What is denotation developed by Anatolian Tigers company's owners about cultural capital of those companies?* To solve it the author conducted the interviews with Anatolian Tigers company's owners and decided to use rhetorical analysis as a method of qualitative data analysis. The interviews were carried out using an electronic mail to contact with participants. Only three of conducted interviews were used in rhetorical analysis.

Using Wikibooks as a source of information about rhetorical analysis Mr Özçobanlar gives the characteristic of this method: *The main aim to perform rhetorical analysis is to take into account 'the purpose, audience, genre, stance, and media/design of the given rhetorical*

situation' (p. 69). He refers also to the researches in which the authors (D. Mc Closkey, T. Ochinoski) used this method to conducted analysis. Above-mentioned Ochinoski and his co-writers refer to the paper of Zhu and Hildebrandt, "Greek and Chinese Classical Rhetoric: the root of cultural differences in business and marketing communication" who used three Aristotelian modes of persuasion ethos, pathos, logos. The same categories have been used by Mr Özçobanlar in his analysis of the interviews.

In the last chapter Findings, Mr Özçobanlar presents the rhetoric of the company owner's interview.

The analysis includes asked questions, answers and their classification of Logos, Ethos and Pathos. Afterwards the author shows the rhetoric analysis of company's web pages. The both analysis let him to conclude that there is a clear predominance of the logos way of justification. There are also a number of Ethos examples of persuasion. Pathos approach was minimized for usage to persuade audience.

The last part of this chapter includes comparison between Greece and Turkey and West of Turkey and Anatolia according to distinguished 11 factors related to cross cultural dimension. Each necessary statistical information is contained in the Appendix. The results of analysis is clearly presents and the conclusions are well-founded. In the Results and Conclusion, the author summarizes his researches and states that values, traditions and skills are the cultural capital which helps the Anatolian Tigers achieve social statues in their own society as well as a sustainable success in their business all around the world. The results of his research refers to the outcomes of the researches which was conducted by other Turkish academics (Karakas, Sarigollu, Kava and Uygur). He underlines the significance of such values as Achievement, Experiences, Ethics, Faith, Fairness, Family, Flexibility, Gratefulness, Helpfulness, Honesty, Integrity, Judiciousness, Loyalty, Modest, Religiousness, Respect and Trust, which have the significant level of importance on business success of Anatolian Tigers.

CONCLUSION and recommendation

The characteristic of the reviewed dissertation entitled *Anatolian Tigers Phenomenon. The Cross Cultural Capital Diversification of the Globally Successful Companies*, written under the academic supervision of Prof. Tomasz Ochinoski, presents an interesting approach and offers an original solutions of scientific problems concerning the role of cultural capital in the development of Turkish enterprises. I appreciate the use of Mixed Method Research, qualitative and quantitative methods of analysis, but I also have some questions that require an answer.

The distinguished three modes of persuasion ethos, logos and pathos are only a part of rhetorical analysis which should include analysis of: speaker, occasion, audience, purpose, and subject of the text. Rhetorical analysis regards the utterances existing independently of the researcher. Rhetorical analysis is being utilized for the speeches existing beyond research process, for example a speech between managers captured during participant observation or an article containing politicians statements. For example a dialogue between two managers

encountered within a participant observation research project (T. Watson, Rhetoric, Discourse and Argument in Organizational Sense Making: A Reflexive Tale. Organization Studies 1995 nr 1.) or journalistic texts (E. Modrzejewska, Lógos, éthos, pathos in the media-political practice. Means of persuasion in the cited utterances of political opposition, Forum Artis Rhetoricae 2012 nr 2.).

In the opinion of the reviewer, Mr Özçobanlar does not give convincing arguments in favour of choosing this method of analysis. Doubts concern both the decision to apply in the analysis of statements of managers obtained as answers to the researcher's questions, and hence resulting from his inspiration. Secondly, there are no clear premises regarding the relationship between the Aristotelian categories of persuasion used and the analysis of the cultural capital of the Anatolian Tigers. In the opinion of the reviewer, the PhD student during the public defence should use the map of Anatolia to present the cities in which investigated entrepreneurs live and work.

This remarks should give an inspiration to the critical view to this dissertation and help Mr Özçobanlar to develop his methodological self-knowledge. They by no means reduce the positive assessment of the dissertation, which derives from:

On the basis of the overall assessment of the dissertation, I state that the doctoral thesis of Mr Özçobanlar entitled “*Anatolian Tigers Phenomenon. The Cross Cultural Capital Diversification of the Globally Successful Companies*” written at the Faculty of Management, University of Warsaw under the academic supervision of Prof. Tomasz Ochinowski meets requirement defined in the Act of 14 March 2003 on Academic Degrees and Title and Degrees and Title in the Arts. On the basis of what is stated above I recommend that the permission for a public defence of the dissertation can be granted.

Piotr Górecki